

APPENDIX 1

No.	Comment
1	Response 1: Closure of manorbier school. I would like to object to the closure of manorbier school Response 2: Manorbier school. Should be kept open
2	Dear Director of Education, I am writing to formally object to the proposed closure of Manorbier Primary School. I strongly urge the council to reconsider this decision in light of the significant negative impact it would have on children, families, and the wider community. My objection is both personal and professional. I completed my training at the school and experienced first-hand the high standard of care, teaching, and support it provides. Manorbier Primary School is not only a place of education but also benefits greatly from the involvement of volunteers, offering valuable opportunities for individuals to gain experience and contribute to the school community. This support enhances the learning environment and strengthens links between the school and the wider community. I have recently moved into the new housing development directly opposite the school, with the clear intention of sending my children there. The presence of new housing demonstrates that this is a growing community, and it is difficult to understand the rationale for reducing local school provision at a time when demand is likely to increase. Closing the school would remove a vital and accessible option for families living in the immediate area. From a wellbeing and safeguarding perspective, requiring young children to travel further distances to attend school raises concerns. Increased travel time can negatively impact attendance, punctuality, and overall wellbeing. Local schools play a crucial role in ensuring children feel safe, settled, and part of their community. Furthermore, the proposal appears inconsistent with the principles outlined in the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child, particularly the right of children to access education that supports their development and wellbeing within their community. The loss of a local, nurturing school environment risks undermining these principles. Manorbier Primary School is also central to community life. It fosters strong relationships between families and provides a sense of belonging that cannot easily be replicated elsewhere. Its closure would weaken community cohesion and remove an important local institution. For these reasons, I respectfully request that the council give full and careful consideration to the long-term consequences of this proposal and explore all possible alternatives to closure. Thank you for taking the time to consider my objection.
3	I am writing to object to the decision to close Manorbier school. Please register my objection.

4	I strongly disagree with the decision. Two of my children attend Manorbier and are thriving. Three of my older children also attended the school. Their great nan even attended! My daughter is year 4 and has been at the school since she was 2 years old. The school is her happy place. My son is 4 and is neurodiverse. School life has been a struggle adapting. The school staff and pupils have been amazing with his journey. He has come on immensely. Already since the decision, he has changed. He is stressed, has change in behavior and old habits that he overcame are coming back all because of the thought of starting a new building with new staff and students. This is a huge adjustment for a child with needs that has been through so much just getting to where he already is. The system is cruel. The level of attention and support at Manorbier school will not be found in any other school! The community, staff, pupils and parents really need this school as most of the children that attend will struggle to adapt to the changes. The access to St.Florence school is terrible! The back lane onto St.florence is one of the worst country lanes, the flooding in the winter makes the journey a risk plus, the parking and access to St.florence school is also terrible if you do not live in the village. Manorbier school is massively important to us as a family.
---	---

5	To the Director of Education, I am writing to formally object to the proposed discontinuation of Manorbier Church in Wales Voluntary Controlled Primary School. I appreciate the opportunity to contribute to this consultation; however, I must also express my deep frustration and disappointment that, despite repeated objections from myself and many others within the community, it appears that financial considerations are being prioritised above all else. My family lives between Jameston and Hodgeston. We deliberately chose Manorbier Primary School for our child, despite being closer to Lamphey Primary School, because of its nurturing environment, its less regimented approach, and the practical benefits it offers to working families. The ability to park nearby and walk a short distance to school each morning has been an important part of our daily routine, supporting both efficiency and wellbeing. Under the current proposal, our child would likely attend St Florence Primary School. While it is undoubtedly a good school, access from our location presents significant challenges. As we fall outside the revised 'Manorbier district' boundaries and are deemed closer to Lamphey, we would not qualify for school transport. This would require us to drive along what we consider to be an unsafe and often congested route, adding stress, increasing travel time, and raising fuel costs. These practical impacts on working families do not appear to have been given sufficient weight. In addition, our local area is prone to flooding, which can make routes impassable. This raises genuine concerns about our child's ability to attend school consistently, which could in turn affect attendance records and place unnecessary pressure on both families and the school. More broadly, I am concerned about the long-term impact of closing a village school on the community. Manorbier Primary School is not only an educational facility but also a central part of village life. Its closure risks leaving a visible and social void within the community. I also question the broader rationale behind the move away from smaller rural schools. Smaller class sizes and close-knit environments have historically supported strong educational and social outcomes. The shift towards larger classes, potentially with reduced support, risks diminishing the quality of education and the individual attention children receive. While I understand that financial pressures exist, it is deeply concerning that the solution appears to be the loss of valued local schools rather than a more balanced approach that considers community impact, accessibility, and children's wellbeing alongside cost. This proposal has left many families feeling unheard and let down. I urge the Council to reconsider and to give greater weight to the voices of the community and the wider consequences of this decision.
---	---

6	Dear Director of Education/ whom it may concern I am writing to formally object to the proposed closure of Ysgol Manorbier. I urge the Council to reconsider this decision, which I believe would have significant and lasting negative consequences for pupils, families, and the wider community. Ysgol Manorbier is more than a place of education; it is a vital part of the local community. The school provides a supportive, inclusive environment where children are able to thrive academically and socially. Closing it risks disrupting pupils' education, wellbeing, and sense of stability—particularly for younger children who depend on a familiar and nurturing setting. It is also important to recognise the resilience shown by the school community following the fire in 2022. Despite the disruption and challenges caused by this incident, staff, pupils, and families worked together to maintain continuity in education and rebuild a sense of normality. To now face closure after such efforts would be deeply disheartening and would undermine the commitment and perseverance demonstrated by all involved. Furthermore, the loss of the school would have a profound impact on the community itself. Local schools often act as hubs that bring families together and strengthen community cohesion. Removing this resource could weaken those connections. I am also concerned about the practical implications of this proposal. Increased travel distances for pupils, potential overcrowding in alternative schools, and the loss of local accessibility to education are all serious issues that deserve careful reconsideration. While I understand the Council must make difficult decisions, I respectfully submit that the long-term social and educational costs of closing Ysgol Manorbier outweigh any short-term benefits. I strongly urge you to explore alternative solutions that preserve this important institution. Thank you for taking the time to consider my concerns. I would appreciate the opportunity to be kept informed of any developments regarding this matter.
7	Manorbier School Closure I Strongly Object to the Mis guided Decision to Close this School..... Several of my Grandchildren attended This School....One whilst fire Broke out The practical implecations Alone should Deter this decision
8	Manorbier school closures. As a grandparent to two former pupils of this excellent school I strongly object to it's closure. The process has dragged on for far too long and hasn't appeared to be transparent. It seems the policy was to wear down both the staff and pupils and governors until they tired of their fight to rebuild. A community will have it's heart torn out by this appalling decision.

9	I would like to write this letter as a former pupil in manorbier school, I was 1 of 2 girls in the whole of 2 years, I never once felt any different or left out by the teachers or pupils. We sing hymns in the morning and I will never forget those memories in the hall with Sharon the head teacher and mrs greenhouse (for a Brief while). I grew up on the council estate in manorbier and let's just say it wasn't like the new estates now. But the school bus ride was one of the things that I loved most about living there. There is a massive sense of community in manorbier, not just because it's small, but because everyone really does help eachother. I will never forget the sports days at that school, the Christingles in the church. My twin brother had dyslexia and it wasn't much of a common thing back then and they were very quick to help in many ways which I believed helped him when he went to secondary, I now live in kilgetty and my daughter goes to stepaside(which is also up for closure). Pembrokeshire is a small place with all different towns and each with their own community. I fear that if you take these schools away it would affect the kids and families when the are growing up. If manorbier was reopened I would move my daughter then in a heartbeat. To me and many others it isn't just another closure of a school, or about the moving of the children. It's a loss of the community and all the hard work that the teachers over the years have put into that school and the children. I doubt you will have many ex pupils write a email. I could go on for ages how that school had a positive effect on me and a child and the highlights of it. I would really appreciate your time to read this whole letter.
10	Dear Sir I still feel to close Manorbier school would be of great determent to our parish Our Parish need young people to keep it alive we don't need old people taking over and costing us in caring fees I do apricate that young people have to move out of the county to get work but its about time you all start thinking of the future of our Parish and County Hope this might make you think
11	To whom it might concern. I am very unhappy to hear of Pembrokeshire Council's decision to close Manobier school. I have heard about the Council's decision to under insure the school. Right of the bat that's a disgrace, imagine if one of the pupils or teachers had died in the fire, there would be manslaughter charges against the Council. History shows that no one died, and the thanks go to the school staff. I know the money can be found to rebuild the school, but the Council prefers to close the school and prefer to ignore the needs of the pupils attending that school. There's a bigger picture here please take time to think about the distress the Council are bringing to the students and the parents who will have to pick up the pieces of their very distressed children, some of which are in the autistic spectrum. These particular children will be scarred for life when they are ripped away from the school they flourish at. The school is more than a teaching academy, it's where the children flourish and grow and learn to live with their own particular problems and associate with their peers.

12	Hi my name is [REDACTED] and am emailing you to object the decision to close manorbier school. I cannot believe after all that the school went through and it nearly being burnt down, that was not their fault, to you now deciding that It should close. Its doesnt make sense. Both my children went to manorbier school and my daughter was still there when the fire happened and they moved to Jameston. I cannot praise the school enough. It was like one big family. Children loved going to school and the school always went out there way not just for kids but you 2. Me and my children went through some tough times with their father and my daughters illness and disability and being a single parent too. The school were always there to offer support, always there to open up too. My primary school when i was a child was a little church school too and it was my fondest memories as it is for my children. Life can be so tough and challenging for kids as it is. Stop closing all these little schools and let the kids have the fond memories of their childhood and school being a positive nice time before they have to grow up. Manorbier school and the staff have been mine and the kids rock and I know they have for many more. Stop trying to take away the heart of the community. All these academy's as your Wanting to turn everythig into creates more bullying , less attention on pupils from staff and more negativity. Let's kids have their childhood and fond memories of schools like this. Please reconsider and think what you are doing to many communities.
----	--

13	Please save Manorbier Primary School - it's the right thing to do. Dear Director of Education My Grandaughter attends Manorbier Primary School, which was recently denied a rebuild following the devastating fire in October 2022. I have been following the story since the fire and have marvelled at the efforts of the Teachers, staff, parents, and friends who have worked tirelessly over the past few years to ensure the school would be rebuilt. When classes moved to accommodation at Jameston Community Centre, the school community stayed together, and the children continued to learn with outstanding outcomes, despite the upheaval. The Council signaled that the move would be temporary, but it has taken three and a half years for them to make a devastating announcement that the school will not be rebuilt. In 2023, Pembrokeshire County Council announced it had backed positive steps towards rebuilding - describing full reinstatement as the 'preferred option'. So what happened for them to change their minds and dash the hopes of the whole school community? Why could you not have been honest from the outcome? There has been a campaign, a petition (with 90% of responses opposed to closure), and strong support, including from the Diocese of St David's who took time to visit the school. Why has this not been taken into consideration? The devastating explanation used to object to the rebuild is about money and the current strategic position of the school, which would never have happened if the truth had been told at the beginning, instead of giving false hope. Three years of hope that the school would be rebuilt - which is the right and proper thing to happen, have been cast aside, without taking any consideration of the impact on the Teachers, parents, and most importantly, the children. I happen to be a grandparent of one of those children. I read the outcome with total disbelief that a Council could disregard what is so obviously the best option, especially when everyone was led to believe that the school would be rebuilt. Has anyone in the Council considered the impact on families of losing a precious local village school? A school delivering outstanding education, with a particular regard to those children with differing needs. A Community Hub that serves its local families. Have you weighed the cost against the potentially damaging impact this will have on the school community: families having to find ways to get their children to a school many miles away (especially working parents); children moving away from what they know to a large school with a very different learning environment; children with special educational needs being disrupted at a crucial period in their learning journey; excellent, dedicated teachers and assistants being displaced? Bigger is not always better, and in this case, it most definitely won't be. I doubt my voice will be heard, but I would ask you to reconsider your decision about rebuilding a precious resource for the sake of the whole community and for the sake of education, not just now, but in the future.
----	--

14	Dear whomever it concerns, I had over 3 generations of my family attend Manorbier school and am heartbroken at the decision you have made. Especially, considering there are more homes now within the catchment area with children. Surely, the insurance would cover the rebuild and if not!! Where has the money gone? I always walked everyday to school and made lifelong friends. The social element of a village begins in the school!!! They learn within school and then live close enough to their peers, enabling them to interact socially in play & learning. This would not be possible if school friends are 3/5 miles away. Unless, you wish to encourage social internet interactions! I honestly believe it's a incorrect decision and wish to object. I know my opinion would not change the decision but if enough of us do. There is a hope 🙏
----	---

15	Manorbier School Closure is not something I would have ever thought I'd hear about or live through & given the circumstances surrounding the closure it's a complete and utter farce ... where are the Insurance monies to rebuild for a fire started by what I'm convinced were workmen smoking on the roof? This is not speculation. This is a parent telling you that the contractors were seen and were told by parents and teachers for smoking on the roof while work was being carried out , this was mentioned to teachers and yet since the fire , since I saw the roof collapse before I knew where my child was No one has addressed the work men smoking on the roof, not the police or council or any one . Upon moving into Manorbier in 2012 We were welcomed from Tenby and thankfully because of the smaller sized community school my son was able to get full support . Following the trauma of Tenbys overcrowding within the school classes my sons autism went undetected for a while , in Tenby he was labled a naughty child at age 6, he would wet the bed and have night terrors about Tenby school he would be so upset going and the teachers there were very stone faced at the time and back then as a single parent there was little or no respect for me and I was pleading with them to pay more attention to my son ... I was petrified for him . His school fear slowly became consuming & self sabotage meant a total collapse in confidence . We made the move to Manorbier and within 6months the Headteacher had took it upon herself to work alongside my son and sure enough later that year we had a referral to Dr simmonds the main specialist for childhood autism in Pembrokeshire & after lengthy talks meetings tests and referrals my son was diagnosed with a social communication disorder , autism and anxiety. Had Manorbier school not picked up the baton when they did ,he would have been lost to a different world within his head and would have most certainly became a very mentally poorly boy indeed . He bloomed at Manorbier and even after his transition to Greenhill school his relationship with teachers and support staff and the headteacher at Manorbier school continued . As did the support when both my daughters attended Manorbier school. Whilst my kids were there that school Supported me as chairwoman ,We had a community park committee/charity where PCC couldn't afford to replace the poor play park areas at the time all in complete disrepair and dangerous & even tho children all needed access to safe and adequate play, it was looking like PCC would rip down two play areas in Manorbier and not rebuild and so we all pulled forces and this incredible school Manorbier helped raise £64.6k with us holding events and parties , bake sales and events , traditional community school events monthly, year after year to achieve our target . It took us 4 whole years to raise that money and alongside the Welsh government , the MOD (Landmarc) PCC maintenance team & grassroots funding we managed to achieve our goal for not just one play park.... We managed to build two!!!! One for toddlers and one for 4-17yr olds in skrinkle Manorbier but without the facilities and support of Manorbier school that would not have happened . ' Manorbier school inspired many community evenings & at Christmas would hold stalls in our local community market always fundraising for the school and love families and charities . The team work ethic is incredible, the work with the Darwin trust, nations Parks , cadw etc etc the school was on target to becoming one of the Greenest schools in Pembrokeshire . They supported communities through Covid and set the school up as a type of support hub using local teachers and councillors and community members do deliver food to the elderly who couldn't get out during Covid In its 150th year (year of the fire) the school was really such a lovely community school and I'll never forget a conversation after the fire where a firefighter praised the teachers and children for the organised way they left the building given the scale of the fire , so much so that all doors to the rest of the building has saved the school from Any further damage . The firecrew stated that thanks to their quick thinking and actions it's only the centre of the building that will need to be rebuilt and that it will be rebuilt , the Victorian part (roof) suffered the most damage but it's very much salvageable . We were so relieved and when we were called back to collect the children's belongings from the hallway outside the fire there was no smoke damage to that part of the building . Our children only just got out when the roof collapsed , had there been fatalities it would have been very different today!!!
----	--

	Following that fire staff didn't take time off they were looking for suitable places to hold the children so that work for the parents could continue and so that the children could be together and be able to talk about the tragedy and keep routine normal & so they weren't left with too much confusion or questions The whole adult community were left with so much confusion and so many questions 3 whole years on and that school Wasn't covered up it was left open to the elements and due to storm and weather damage the whole of that school has suffered and that's due to neglect so not only is there a question over that but the cause of the fire and no insurance money to rebuild doesn't sit well with many of us , I call for another enquiry and some local corrupt council members or previous council members to be excluded from such reports . Manorbier school is the heartbeat of this community and by leaving so many unanswered questions which we have every right to question you leave a community in peril. Unfair and unjust and if you can't provide logical answers as to why the building can't be rebuilt as a school then I suggest it's rebuilt .It's a church building too so would need to be repaired to hand back to the diocese so what on earth is happening and why was closure ever forced upon this school.
--	--

16	Dear committee, I am very saddened by your decision to close Manorbier school as it will be a great loss to the community of Manorbier. Not only is it a facility of education but a place which binds the community together. Communities are fast losing all their amenities, where friendship new and old help shape the future of the area. I noticed that vacant school places in Tenby area was quoted within the report which worries me in the context that this is just about finance. It is nice that St Florence school has stepped up and offered places to the existing Manorbier children but anyone who has travelled down the lanes from Manorbier to St Florence will know that these roads are poor with few passing places and extremely hazardous in poor weather conditions. Again I see no mention of this in the report . If the school closure goes ahead then the council really needs to consider how safe these roads are for school traffic. In conclusion you are not just closing another school, you are closing a unique communication hub which has helped bind everyone who lives and works within the area. It is not a thing that you can buy or recreate, once closed a really big part of the community dies with it. No longer a community, but more like a housing estate. I believe that Pembrokeshire council should be supporting rural communities and should support the people of Manorbier to keep their school open.
17	I write with regard to your proposal to close this very special, much loved school. The local residents are certainly in favour of keeping the school open and their views are what is important here. Please do the maths and you will see that rebuilding the school, maybe together with some crowd funding, will be the right way forward.
18	To whom it may concern I am writing to object the proposed closure of Manorbier School. Although I no longer have school aged children my son previously attended Manorbier School from age 3 in Nursery until leaving at 11. From being a single mum with no transport Manorbier school was absolutely vital for ensuring my son could regularly attend school. Public transport in the area is difficult to use with just one bus an hour and having a school nearby meant we could at least catch the bus one way and walk the other way. It was also so important for my child and other children going forward to have friends in school in the same area. To the proposal that the school is closed and pupils transfered into St Florence school I worry how this will affect parents with no transport or that have to get to work after dropping children off. To drive to st Florence from Manorbier using the back single track road and down the hill is very difficult and the increase in traffic will only make this difficult road even worse. I'm happy to provide any further information or support for the continuation of Manorbier school going forward.

19	To whom it may concern, I was once a student at Manorbier school. I moved to Pembrokeshire at just 8 years old after uprooting my entire life and leaving all my friends and sense of life behind. The staff at Manorbier were by far the most supportive and caring people I have ever met, they helped me understand my new way of life and encouraged me to make new friendships and try new activities which I'd never thought of before. My parents both travelled a lot with work, and fortunately I had family who could care for myself and my younger sister when my parents were away, but that was made a lot easier for them with our school being in the same village as our residence. My father and grandfather both went to Manorbier school, and made fond memories there, as my sister and I did. In my opinion the closure of such a treasurable place of EDUCATION is atrocious. Children, such as myself at the time, deserved to be in a smaller environment where the staff are able to perform more 1-1 nurturing, but by sending all the pupils to schools such as St Florence or Tenby this will be severely impacted. I personally struggled with confidence and my social skills before my years at this school, as well as severely struggling with subjects such as maths, but due to the devotion and ability of the teachers they were able to provide me with 1-1 support with my education, as well as supporting me to be the confident and resilient person I am today. Please consider that other children need schools like Manorbier to help them grow as people before they enter secondary school where options like the ones provided at Manorbier are severely limited. No amount of money saved is more precious than a child's quality of life while in the lower education system. Please consider my request to cancel the closure of Manorbier primary school.
----	---

Dear Sir/Madam,

I am writing to formally object to the proposed closure of Manorbier Church in Wales VC School.

As a parent, I strongly believe this decision is fundamentally flawed and fails to adequately consider the broader educational, social, legal, and financial impacts on our children and community.

Firstly, the financial justification for closure appears short-sighted. While immediate cost savings may be cited, there is insufficient transparency regarding the long-term financial implications, including increased transport costs, pressure on receiving schools, and the wider economic impact on the local community. A full and transparent cost-benefit analysis should be provided before any irreversible decision is made.

In addition, there are specific financial and legal concerns relating to the school site itself following the fire in October 2022. It is my understanding that a covenant exists on the land requiring that the school building be reinstated prior to being returned to the Diocese. If this is the case, then regardless of the decision to close the school, the Council will still be financially liable for reinstatement or compensation to the Church. This raises serious questions about whether closure would in fact deliver any meaningful financial saving, and whether this liability has been fully accounted for in the Council's decision-making process.

Secondly, I have serious concerns regarding the legality and fairness of the process. The closure of a rural school must comply not only with statutory procedures but also with Welsh Government policies designed to protect access to local education. It is not clear that all alternative options have been properly explored or that meaningful consultation has taken place in a way that genuinely reflects the views of affected families.

I would also like to highlight my child's individual circumstances as a pupil with Additional Learning Needs (ALN). My child has thrived at Manorbier School, which provides a nurturing, supportive environment that has been essential to their development, confidence, and wellbeing. The small school setting and strong staff relationships have enabled their needs to be understood and met effectively. Under the Additional Learning Needs and Education Tribunal (Wales) Act 2018, the Council has a statutory duty to secure the provision set out in a child's Individual Development Plan (IDP) and to ensure that provision is appropriate to meet their needs. I am deeply concerned that, if my child is required to move to a different and potentially larger school, there is a significant risk that this duty will not be met in practice. The disruption caused by relocation, combined with a less personalised environment, may result in a failure to deliver equivalent support.

Furthermore, the Act and associated Code emphasise the importance of a person-centred approach and continuity of provision. Removing my child from a setting where their needs are currently being successfully met risks not only educational regression but also a deterioration in emotional wellbeing. This raises serious concerns about whether the proposal is compatible with the Council's legal obligations, and whether a full ALN impact assessment has been undertaken.

The proposal also appears to conflict with the Welsh Government's commitments to rural communities, as outlined in its policy frameworks. The loss of a village school undermines the sustainability of rural life, weakening community cohesion and reducing accessibility to education for future generations.

Furthermore, the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 places a duty on public bodies to consider the long-term impact of their decisions. Closing Manorbier School risks harming the well-being of current and future pupils by removing a vital, community-based learning environment that supports not only academic development but also social and emotional wellbeing.

On that note, the potential negative impact on pupils' mental health and wellbeing cannot be overstated. Smaller schools often provide nurturing, supportive environments where children thrive. Transitioning pupils to larger, more distant schools may lead to increased anxiety, longer travel times, and reduced individual support.

Finally, there are concerns regarding the impact on the Welsh language. Local schools play a crucial role in promoting and sustaining

	Welsh language use within communities. The closure risks contributing to its decline, contrary to national objectives to reach one million Welsh speakers. In conclusion, I urge the Council to reconsider this proposal and to fully explore sustainable alternatives that preserve local education provision. The decision to close a rural school should not be taken lightly, and in this case, the evidence suggests that the long-term harm outweighs any short-term gains. I respectfully request that this objection be given full consideration as part of the decision-making process.
--	---

21	Dear Sir/Madam, I write to formally object to the proposed closure of Manorbier Church in Wales VC School. In my view, this proposal is fundamentally flawed and fails to adequately account for the broader educational, financial, legal, and community implications. The financial rationale lacks sufficient transparency, particularly in relation to long-term costs, including transport, increased demand on receiving schools, and potential liabilities associated with the school site following the fire in October 2022. If a covenant requires reinstatement of the building prior to its return to the Diocese, it is unclear whether any genuine financial saving would be achieved. I also have serious concerns regarding the fairness and legality of the process. It is not evident that all viable alternatives have been properly explored, nor that the consultation process has meaningfully reflected the views of affected families, as required under relevant Welsh Government guidance. Furthermore, my child has Additional Learning Needs and has benefitted significantly from the supportive and nurturing environment provided by Manorbier School. Under the Additional Learning Needs and Education Tribunal (Wales) Act 2018, the Council is under a statutory duty to secure appropriate provision. I am concerned that relocation to a larger setting may compromise this provision and adversely affect both educational progress and wellbeing. The proposal also appears inconsistent with wider policy commitments, including those relating to the sustainability of rural communities and the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015. The closure of the school risks undermining community cohesion, reducing access to local education, and negatively impacting both pupil wellbeing and the Welsh language. In light of the above, I respectfully urge the Council to reconsider this proposal and to fully explore sustainable alternatives. The potential long-term detriment appears to outweigh any short-term benefits.
----	---

Response 1: Dear Director of Education,

I am writing to formally object to the proposed closure of Manorbier Church in Wales Voluntary Controlled School.

I am deeply concerned that this decision does not adequately reflect the strength of local opposition or the unique circumstances surrounding the school. Over 90% of respondents in the consultation opposed closure, which clearly demonstrates the value the community places on the school and the strength of feeling about its future.

The rationale for closure—particularly the issue of surplus places—appears to be based on flawed assumptions. Capacity figures linked to a fire-damaged and currently unusable building do not present an accurate picture of the school's potential. Since the devastating fire in October 2022, the school has continued to operate from Jameston Village Hall, showing resilience, adaptability, and ongoing demand from families.

Closing the school now, while it is still recovering from this exceptional circumstance, feels both premature and unjust. Rather than being supported through recovery, the school is being penalised for factors beyond its control.

There are also serious concerns about the impact on pupils. Relocating children to other schools, such as St Florence, will disrupt their education, social development, and emotional wellbeing. Increased travel distances will place additional strain on young children and their families, particularly in a rural area where transport options may be limited.

Manorbier School is more than just a place of education—it is a vital part of the community. Its loss would weaken local identity, reduce community cohesion, and diminish opportunities for families to engage locally.

I urge Pembrokeshire County Council to reconsider this proposal and instead explore viable alternatives, including rebuilding the school, reassessing capacity based on realistic figures, and supporting the school's long-term recovery and sustainability.

This decision will have lasting consequences for children and the wider community. I respectfully ask that you take full account of the strong public opposition and the exceptional circumstances before proceeding further. **Response 2:** Dear Director of Education,

I am writing to formally object to the proposed closure of Manorbier Church in Wales Voluntary Controlled School.

The decision to proceed with closure, despite overwhelming opposition from the community, is deeply troubling. When more than 90% of consultation responses reject a proposal, it raises serious questions about whether the consultation process is being meaningfully considered in decision-making.

23	It is also concerning that the justification for closure relies on capacity and surplus place figures that appear to be based on a building that has not been usable since the 2022 fire. The current situation—where the school continues to operate successfully from Jameston Village Hall—demonstrates that there is still demand and viability. Judging the school's future based on a damaged site does not reflect its true potential. From an outside perspective, it seems fundamentally unfair that a school which has already suffered a major setback is now facing permanent closure rather than being supported to rebuild and recover. This risks setting a worrying precedent for how similar situations might be handled in the future. There are also broader concerns about the long-term impact on rural communities. Schools like Manorbier are often central to local life, and their closure can contribute to gradual decline in community cohesion, local engagement, and even population sustainability. While financial pressures are understandable, decisions of this magnitude should carefully balance cost with social value, fairness, and long-term community impact. In this case, it does not appear that those factors have been given sufficient weight. I respectfully urge Pembrokeshire County Council to reconsider this proposal and to explore alternative solutions that would allow the school to continue serving its community.
----	--

24	Dear Director of Education, I write in a personal capacity as a parent and as an objector to proposals affecting rural schools, including Ysgol Clydau, to formally submit my objection to the proposed closure of Manorbier Church in Wales Voluntary Controlled School. This objection is made on the basis that the proposal appears procedurally and substantively flawed, and fails to give appropriate weight to relevant considerations, including consultation outcomes, contextual circumstances, and the statutory duty to consider the long-term educational and community impact of school closures. The consultation process reportedly demonstrated overwhelming opposition to closure, with over 90% of respondents objecting. It is not evident how such a significant level of opposition has been meaningfully taken into account in the decision-making process. A decision proceeding in the face of such opposition raises concerns as to whether the consultation has been given proper regard or has been treated as a procedural formality. The rationale for closure appears to rely heavily on surplus place calculations that are based on a building which has been unusable since the 2022 fire. It is not reasonable to assess long-term educational provision on the basis of a temporarily unavailable or damaged site, particularly where the school has continued to operate effectively in alternative accommodation at Jameston Village Hall. This raises concerns about the evidential basis underpinning the proposal. The school's current situation is the result of an unforeseen and exceptional event (the fire in 2022). It is submitted that it is irrational and procedurally unfair to allow this circumstance to become a determinative factor in favour of permanent closure, rather than recovery and reinstatement. Insufficient weight appears to have been given to the impact on pupils, including increased travel times, disruption to education, and loss of continuity and pastoral support. There also appears to be inadequate consideration of the wider statutory and policy importance of maintaining rural educational provision and community sustainability. As someone also engaged in efforts to protect Ysgol Clydau from closure, I am concerned that decisions of this nature risk establishing a precedent whereby rural schools are treated as financially dispensable regardless of community value or educational outcomes. For the reasons set out above, I respectfully submit that the proposal to close Manorbier Church in Wales Voluntary Controlled School is not supported by a robust or properly balanced assessment of relevant factors. I therefore formally object to the proposal in its current form and request that it be withdrawn or subjected to a full reconsideration on a properly evidenced basis.
25	Regarding the planned closure of Manorbier school. I feel that this is incredibly short sighted, especially the growing issues surrounding us that stem from large institutions, where small ones have been amalgamated. This causes unnecessary friction & a breaking down of small communities.

Re: The proposal for discontinuation of Manorbier VC School

With reference to the proposal for the closure of Manorbier School that was recently put before the council, we would like to avail ourselves our statutory right to strongly oppose this decision.

This grossly unfair and unjustified action will have a hugely detrimental and ongoing future effect on the four communities within the area of Manorbier which this school caters for.

Village schools are essential. They're vital hubs of community life, offering personalised education through small class sizes all whilst fostering strong community ties. They are literally the heart of the community.

They can also provide local venues for events, meetings and provide valuable amenities.

Rural schools provide children increased leadership roles, a better sense of belonging, can help reduce anxiety and promote safe nurturing environments, help with mental health and prevent rural isolation. Children can get lost in larger institutions.

School closures lead to community decline; the death knell of villages in the locality!!

Our school was shown on His Majesty's first Christmas speech in 2022. We were all deeply saddened and devastated by our school fire and by the negligence of the contractors in their actions to repair the roof. Please explain why there was further negligence by PCC and the contractors as to why you failed to protect from exposure from the elements the school structure. You failed in your duty to protect the remaining building, much of which was undamaged. In the meantime the school house has been repaired so why not the actual school?? They also put in danger the lives of the children who were fortunately evacuated quickly.

Why has the negligent behaviour of the contractor not been addressed and suitable compensation sought in respect of the school? Has any claim been made against those at fault? Has any money has been paid? If so, where has the money gone? If no, why not? These questions need answering and the public wants and deserves to know. You are a public authority after all and answerable. You have a statutory obligation to inform the public of all actions and spending within the county. You have not done this. Perhaps we should call for a judicial review.

Your decisions were based on lack of numbers of pupils. I hope you realise the numbers were restricted by the amount the Jameston hall were legally restricted to, to provide a temporary school, and being of limited capacity.

Since the fire there has been two housing association sites built, both on the proviso of a local school in our community. That's not including the numerous private builds projected or currently ongoing. Without a local school, will they be expected to be bussed or make their own way elsewhere? What about those parents that don't have transport? What about your commitment to net zero? It was noted that you proposed that St Florence village school would absorb the pupils from Manorbier. Has a risk assessment been done? Are you aware of how narrow and dangerous these roads such as Eastern Lane are? They are simply not walkable.

There is a predicted increase in the population of Manorbier, including Jameston, Lydstep and Manorbier Newton but you have failed to account for that in your future planning in the provision of your statutory duties towards these communities, a decision made by

	councillors and directors that have absolutely no interest in our community. What are we paying our council tax for exactly?? Please reconsider your decision for closure! It's unjust and wholly unfair.
--	--

27	Dear Sirs The continued threat to our rural schools, both in Tegryn and Manorbier and across the County, is a threat to that undermines the fabric of village life. Without the presence of a village school these communities will turn into retirement locations, increasing isolation and mental health issues. Children are the life blood of our villages and that needs nurturing and should be valued The repercussions of your decisions to save money will cost these communities far more. Families will no longer move to villages as the cost implications of travel and time are too high. Parents will choose to home school , which will greatly impact children's education and social skills House prices will fall and community spirit dwindle. Please make your decisions a consider one . You may think it's only about money at the end of the day, but your choices will impact the future of every family, child, head teachers, staff member and the wider community alike
28	Dear Sir/madam I was really disappointed at your recent decision to close our village school after the fire in October 2022. I'm a local resident since birth and I'm now a dad to a six month old and was expecting to send him to our local school. It was promised that the school rebuild would be completed by September 2025, a promise that was broken. There are so many youngsters in the village and three surrounding areas that the school provides for. You only have to look at the local magpie baby group in the Giraldu Centre. These children should be provided with a village school. They deserve it! My partner doesn't drive and I work long hours. We have no means of transporting our son to St Florence. Please reconsider your decision. A school is an integral part of community life and we need it desperately, not just for our pupils but for future children who will be living at the new huge estate in Jameston. Thank you.
29	Manorbier school is that the centre of a massive catchment area, but not only that, they are brilliant at teaching and nurturing the support of all children emotionally, socially and academically. The fact that those children lost their school and the security of their education due to county council and the insurance is diabolical! County preach that they care for education and children but can't support them during their time of need. Closing this school would be detrimental to manorbier and the surrounding areas and community

30	Dear sir , I have been appalled at the lack of thought for the children and teachers who attended this school before the fire. It appears that they can just be moved along like luggage. The value of the smaller and local primary school cannot be understated. These schools teach skills for life by their very nature of being smaller , with fewer children in each year group enabling them to interact with older and younger children in lessons and in play. Their travel time is short and much less stressful than having to go into town with many unknown people and places. The smaller schools broaden horizons by friendly local faces which can be part of their home community. Not detached as it would be attending a school five miles away. I have family that attended Manorbier school one hundred years ago and they loved it. They walked there and home again collecting friends as they went. What a shame to lose that historic building and site especially as so many more houses have been and still are being built close by. What's the betting the locality of the school encouraged their planning application. So come on PCC think of the real people involved in your decisions. Invest in quality education for the young generation ,please just get it right for us all !!!
31	I would like to Put in an objection to the closure of Manorbier vcp school, I think it would be a sad loss of a great school, My grandmother, mother, me and then my children all attendedd Manorbier school over the years. The staff where second to none with my children, it would be a sad shame to lose the village school. We are a very close-knit community, we really do ow if to the next generation of youngsters to keep this fabulous school up an running with the funding that they should receive. That school always had family feel to it, the teachers and staff are so caring and brilliant, it deserves the justice it is owed.
32	I am writing to express my strong opposition to the proposed closure of Manorbier village school. Village schools in Pembrokeshire are at the heart of our communities, providing not only education but also a sense of stability, belonging, and identity for local families. Closing the school would undoubtedly have a negative impact on the children and weaken the community. I strongly support the petition to rebuild this school. Thank you.
33	It seems so wrong to close the school when planning has been given to houses on the basis of a school in the community. Travelling to alternatives is not easy. This is impacting a rural community.
34	This emails serves notice of my objection of the following summary "the Director of Education be authorised to commence general statutory consultation on the proposal to discontinue Manorbier Church in Wales Voluntary Controlled School."
35	We are writing to object to the possible closure of the above named School on the grounds that it is a vital part of the Village, serves the local School children well and has done for many, many years until the fire caused by workers repairing the roof. Why is the Insurance not paying g for the repairs and why the decision to close the school after staff and pupils have been accommodated in another part of the Village.

36	The way that the decision to close Manorbier CV School has come about is absolutely disgusting and very damaging to the community in Manorbier. We should be preserving our schools, especially in this case, since the insurance claim for the fire damage has been paid out! Stop this madness, and keep Manorbier CV School open and keep investing in children in smaller communities, where children are not forced to travel for many miles to get to school or to place an extra burden on parents, at a time when the cost of fuel and power has risen so much in so little a time. Protect local education. Protect Manorbier CV School.
37	I am writing to formally object to the proposal to close Manorbier Church in Wales Voluntary Controlled School, effective 1 September 2026. My objection is based on the following critical points: Flawed Data on Capacity: The consultation cites a surplus capacity of over 70% based on the original building's capacity of 86 pupils. This does not reflect the reality that pupils have been limited to temporary accommodation with a functional capacity of only 30 for over three years. Enforced Displacement: The decline in pupil numbers is a direct result of the 2022 fire and the subsequent uncertainty and lack of space in temporary facilities, which has forced local families to seek other schools despite a preference for Manorbier. Community and Wellbeing Impact: Losing a school that has served as the heart of the village for over 150 years will have a detrimental effect on the long-term viability of the community and the wellbeing of current pupils who have already endured years of disruption. Moral Obligation to Rebuild: The Council initially signaled that reinstating the school was the preferred option. It is unacceptable to use the consequences of a fire as a justification for permanent closure rather than fulfilling the promise to rebuild. Diocesan Support: I echo the opposition from the St Davids Diocesan Board of Finance, which has consistently called for the school to be reinstated. I urge the Council to reconsider this proposal and instead work with the community and the Diocese to rebuild and reinvest in Manorbier School

38	I write to formally object the proposal to close Manorbier Church in Wales VC School, a school which has served as a vital educational and community institution for the people of Manorbier, Jameston, and Manorbier Newton for generations. Manorbier School has consistently provided a high standard of education before and after the fire that took place in 2022. This success has been achieved through the dedication, professionalism, and tireless efforts of its teaching staff, leadership team, and governors, whose contributions appear to have been undervalued and disregarded by the council throughout this process. The school has long provided an inclusive and supportive learning environment in which pupils of all abilities have been able to thrive. Of particular concern is the significant impact that the proposed closure will have on children with additional learning needs and those who rely upon the stability and familiarity the school provides. I do not believe sufficient regard has been given to the educational, emotional, and social consequences this decision has had upon those children and their families. Furthermore, I must express serious concern regarding the manner in which Pembrokeshire County Council has conducted this process. The handling of this situation has fallen considerably short of the standards of transparency, fairness, accountability, and community engagement that the Council is expected to uphold under its own stated principles and public responsibilities. The Council's conduct throughout this matter appears inconsistent with its declared commitment of "working together to improve lives," and has caused significant distress and loss of confidence in the council within the local community. The pupils, staff, parents, governors, and wider community connected to Manorbier School deserved meaningful support, genuine consultation, and respectful treatment throughout this process. Instead, many feel that their concerns, evidence, and contributions have been overlooked and dismissed. The community has been profoundly let down by the council throughout this process, and therefore I call upon the council to reconsider the proposed closure to fully assess the long-term impact it will have on our community, and to ensure that any future decisions are undertaken in a manner that is lawful, transparent and reflective of the needs and views of those these decisions affect. Thank you for taking my concerns into consideration,
----	--

39	Unfortunately Manorbier VC School has been through many difficult years and is now facing closure through no fault of the wonderfully committed staff and pupils. This School has been the heart at the heart of the community for so many generations that have built friendships and help young children of the area. My family have had 4 generations attend this school which has played a key role in developing us as educated members of a rural community. Living in this area we live in a thoughtful and caring for each other attitude community that has been built up as life lasting friendship we developed for each other from a very early age. I consider myself lucky to live in an area that I believe that I can bond with most of my neighbour's and we all help each other due to the fact we have all grown together from early years at school and constantly help with local projects. The school had been let down when repair works were allowed to be carried out in dangerous conditions and this had a devastating outcome. Luckily no one was hurt except for the communities trust in the councils responsibility to put this right. The community has battled through and managed to keep the school running in not a ideal situation. For anyone new to the area or a new family our children's safety and education is always a priority. Of course the numbers would decline after such a traumatic experience! When looking for a potential school we all consider the following - Safety - Environment - Facilities - Investment into the school - Class room sizes - Accessibility - Standard of education Unfortunately most of these positive points are there in the ashes of what was once a happy and amazing building where so many of us grew and have fond memories and experiences. So it is no surprise that current numbers are not what they should be as Manorbier VC School has been let down so many times, but the staff still deliver a remarkable sense of education and community spirit. Where has the support been to help rectify mistakes? Why has the community got to fight together for something that was taken away from us through from an outside incompetent influence?
40	I object to the closure of Manorbier School. There is a growing population in Manorbier and Jameston with new housing being built. The school is and always has been the hub of the community. It makes no sense whatsoever to send pupils to St Florence School along very narrow roads and NO bus service either. If you don't have a car, you are stuffed. Please save our school

41	I object to the proposal to discontinue Manorbier Church in Wales VC School My reason is because Pembrokeshire County Council has a statutory duty to secure sufficient and suitable school places in its area and to determine whether it is making the best use of the resources and facilities to deliver the opportunities that children deserve. Manorbier School is essential to deliver these opportunities that local children deserve especially as more families come to live in the area.
42	I am writing to formally object to the proposal to permanently close Manorbier Church in Wales VC School. I believe this proposal is unjust and a failure of the council's duty of care to the children, staff, and the local community of Manorbier. 1. The Cause of the Closure The school was destroyed in October 2022 by a fire, which originated in the roof space due to 'hot works' being carried out by contractors. Children were present during this event, which was an traumatic and avoidable incident caused by third parties, not a failing of the school itself. Therefore, this closure is punishing the community for the negligence of those contracted by, or operating on behalf of, the council. 2. Broken Promises to Rebuild Following the fire, the community was assured by Pembrokeshire County Council on multiple occasions over the past three years that the school would be rebuilt, allowing pupils to return to a permanent site rather than the temporary accommodation at Jameston Village Hall. Reversing this decision now is a betrayal of trust and demonstrates a complete disregard for previous commitments made to parents and local residents. 3. Impact on Community and History Manorbier School has been at the heart of our community for over 150 years. Closing it would destroy a vital community asset, forcing local children to travel further and disrupting their education and social development. The school is far more than a building; it is a vital part of the community's heritage and history. 4. Failure to Invest and Manage Risk Rather than investing in a new building, the Council appears to be using the fire as a reason to close a school that they have failed to adequately reinstate, despite the availability for a rebuild. The proposed permanent closure is an easy way out for the authority to cover up their corruption at the expense of our children's future. I urge Pembrokeshire County Council to immediately abandon this proposal, honor their previous promises, and proceed with the full rebuilding of Manorbier School.
43	I would like my objection to the closure of Manobier Church in Wales school be noted.
44	I strongly object to the closing of this School, I was raised in Manorbier and studied at the school in my formative years, it gave me the greatest opportunity in my life to be able to become a Fire officer in the West Midlands Fire Service, a plumbing engineer and a strong human being. Do not close this school!

I write to formally object to the proposed closure of Manorbier School.

This proposal has caused profound distress and disappointment amongst pupils, families, staff, governors, former pupils, and the wider community. The school has served generations of local children and continues to provide a high standard of education within a caring, supportive, and nurturing environment. The dedication of staff and the strength of the school community should not be overlooked in this process.

One of the most difficult aspects of this proposal is the long-standing assurances given to the community following the fire at the school. For years, families, staff, and pupils were repeatedly led to believe that the school would be rebuilt and that its future remained secure. These assurances continued right up until this academic year. To now move towards closure feels like a betrayal of the promises made to the entire community. Expectations were raised repeatedly, only for those commitments to be abandoned without meaningful explanation.

I am also deeply concerned by the apparent lack of consideration given to the overwhelming strength of feeling demonstrated during previous consultations. The community has consistently and passionately opposed closure proposals. Parents, residents, former pupils, governors, and local organisations have all made clear the importance of retaining the school. It is difficult to see how the depth of this opposition has been properly reflected in the decision-making process.

Furthermore, insufficient regard appears to have been given to the objections raised by the Diocese regarding the closure of a Church in Wales school which they own. The Diocese's position and responsibilities should carry significant weight in any decision affecting the future of the school and its religious foundation.

While many within the community acknowledge that educational provision may need reform and adaptation, closing rural primary schools cannot continue to be viewed as the default solution. Schools are the heart of rural communities. Their loss contributes directly to the decline of village life, discourages young families from remaining in or moving to rural areas, and weakens the long-term sustainability of Welsh-speaking and close-knit communities. The closure of another rural primary school feels like another nail in the coffin for villages already struggling to retain essential services and family life.

I am also extremely concerned about the accessibility of the proposed alternative school for many families within the community. Public transport links between the village and the proposed receiving school are extremely limited and, in some cases, effectively non-existent. While the provision of school transport for pupils may satisfy minimum operational requirements, it does not address the very real barriers this creates for parents and carers who do not drive.

Parental engagement is widely recognised as being essential to a child's educational success. However, parents without access to private transport may find themselves unable to attend parents' evenings, school performances, sports days, extracurricular activities, meetings, or other important events that form a vital part of school and community life. This risks isolating families from their children's education and undermining the partnership between home and school.

There are also serious practical concerns that appear not to have been properly considered. For example, if a child becomes unwell or distressed during the school day, how is a parent without transport expected to collect them promptly from a distant school with poor

	public transport access? These are not hypothetical concerns but realistic difficulties that many rural families will face on a regular basis. The proposal may also have wider unintended consequences for the sustainability of rural communities. Families may feel they have little choice but to relocate closer to larger towns such as Pembroke or Milford Haven in order to access education and services more easily. Yet the local authority has itself acknowledged that primary school places in these towns are already oversubscribed. It is therefore difficult to understand how encouraging further movement into these areas represents sustainable long-term planning for education or communities in Pembrokeshire. I also believe this proposal conflicts with the principles and ambitions of the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015. The Act places a duty on public bodies to think long-term, to support cohesive communities, and to improve the social, cultural, environmental, and economic well-being of Wales. Removing a successful and valued village school undermines these objectives rather than supporting them. In particular, the proposal appears inconsistent with the goals of creating cohesive communities and a vibrant culture and thriving Welsh communities. The school is far more than simply a building. It is a vital community asset, a source of identity and belonging, and an environment where children are known, supported, and encouraged to thrive. Decisions of this magnitude should not be based solely on short-term financial or organisational considerations without fully recognising the lasting impact on children, families, and the wider rural community. I respectfully urge the decision-makers to reconsider this proposal and to work collaboratively with the community to identify sustainable alternatives that preserve educational provision within the village.
--	--

46	I have 2 children with Autism that attended Manorbier school and absolutely thrived with the love, care and dedication of the staff there. My son [REDACTED], when he first started couldn't even walk into a classroom or dinner hall, without feeling overwhelmed and scared. The teachers nurtured him and helped him build his confidence, until he was able to join in with the other children. He was able to join in on all the school plays, I was so proud. And cried at every one, he was so happy and loved going to school. Fast forward to today, both my son and daughter are now 14 and 16. After leaving Manorbier VC School, they attended Greenhill secondary school, for the first couple of years both children were OK, until Greenhill took the special needs support from my son. [REDACTED] became seriously mentally ill under the "care" of Greenhill, he became so scared and felt too much pressure to cope with the demands the secondary school put on him. That he tried to commit suicide several times, attendance was all the school cared about. Sadly I had no choice but to pull out both my children and homeschool them both. My son is so severely damaged by the secondary school, that he is now under the care of CHAMS team, with OT'S for life! Both children were so happy, carefree and had lots of support at Manorbier Village school, It will be detrimental to all of the children and future children in Manorbier to lose the school. I know pembrokeshire county council want to build houses on the site of the school, you also want the field next door (buttyland caravan park) for houses. To put this before the wellbeing of local children in Manorbier is disgusting! Other schools are not meeting the needs of local children, that's way parents like myself had no choice but to homeschool our children.
47	I would like to object to the closing of Manorbier school as the surrounding villages of Jameston, St Florence, Manorbier and Lamphey grow the schools of St Florence and Lamphey are not big enough to cope, Pembrokeshire council would then be looking to rebuild a school to take pressure off neighbouring schools.

1. Introduction

I write to formally object to the proposal to discontinue Manorbier Church in Wales VC School.

This objection is made on the basis that the proposal, and the accompanying Consultation Report (February 2026), fails to comply with the requirements of the School Organisation Code (Wales) and is therefore procedurally and substantively flawed.

2. Failure to Overcome the Presumption Against Closure of a Rural School

Manorbier VC School is a rural school and therefore benefits from a statutory presumption against closure.

The Council is required to demonstrate that:

- Closure is the only viable option, and
- All reasonable alternatives have been fully and rigorously explored

The Consultation Report does not meet this threshold.

3. Inadequate Consideration of Alternatives

The report states that several options were considered, including:

- Reinstatement of the school
- Federation models
- Amalgamation proposals

However, these options are dismissed without:

- Detailed financial comparison
- Feasibility analysis
- Transparent evaluation criteria

Statements such as alternatives being “not logical” are unsupported by evidence.

This represents a failure to properly discharge the Council’s duty to meaningfully consider alternatives, particularly given the rural presumption against closure.

4. Flawed and Incomplete Financial Case

The financial justification for closure is incomplete and one-sided.

The report focuses on:

- The capital cost of rebuilding

However, it fails to include:

- Long-term transport costs
- Costs of expanding receiving schools
- Whole-life cost comparisons

In addition, key financial information—particularly relating to insurance settlements and rebuild costs—has been withheld on the grounds of “commercial sensitivity.”

This prevents consultees from making a properly informed response and undermines the integrity of the consultation process.

5. Misleading Use of Pupil Number Data

The report relies heavily on historic surplus capacity figures, including pre-2022 data.

However:

- The school was severely disrupted by the 2022 fire
- Pupils have been educated in temporary accommodation since that time
- The Council acknowledges that uncertainty has influenced parental choice

Despite this, the report fails to properly contextualise pupil numbers or assess potential recovery following reinstatement.

This results in a misleading presentation of demand and viability.

6. Failure to Properly Consider Consultation Responses

The Consultation Report confirms that:

- Over 90% of respondents opposed the proposal
- The Diocese and Trade Unions also objected

However, the Council's responses:

- Do not meaningfully engage with the substance of objections
- Provide only generalised or dismissive replies

This raises serious concerns that the consultation process was not conducted with a genuinely open mind, as required by law.

7. Inadequate Community Impact Assessment

The Community Impact Assessment contains significant weaknesses:

- It downplays the importance of the school as a community hub
- It assumes closure will not affect population or family movement, based on current attendance patterns distorted by the fire
- It reaches conclusions that are inconsistent with the evidence presented

For example, the report acknowledges negative impacts on:

- Travel
- Access to walking routes
- Some families

Yet concludes the overall impact is minimal.

This represents an irrational and internally inconsistent assessment.

8. Insufficient Assessment of Transport and Accessibility

The report acknowledges:

- A negative impact on travel
- Loss of ability for some pupils to walk or cycle

However, it does not provide:

- Detailed journey time analysis
- Road safety evidence
- Assessment of cumulative impact on young children

This fails to meet the requirement to properly assess access to education and pupil wellbeing.

9. Weak Welsh Language Impact Assessment

The report concludes that the impact on the Welsh language will be “neutral,” despite:

- Significant concerns raised by consultees
- Evidence of strong Welsh language provision at the school

The reasoning provided is limited and lacks robust supporting evidence.

This raises concerns regarding compliance with statutory duties relating to the Welsh language.

10. Evidence of Pre-Determination

The tone and structure of the report suggest that closure is the preferred outcome.

- Alternatives are framed negatively
- Justifications for closure are consistently reinforced
- Consultation responses are not meaningfully integrated into the outcome

This gives rise to a reasonable perception of pre-determination, which undermines the legality of the consultation.

11. Conclusion

For the reasons set out above, the proposal to discontinue Manorbier VC School is:

- Not supported by a robust or balanced evidence base
- Not compliant with the School Organisation Code
- Not sufficient to overcome the statutory presumption against closure of a rural school

Accordingly, I respectfully request that Pembrokeshire County Council:

1. Withdraw the current proposal, and
2. Undertake a revised process that:
 - o Fully evaluates all reasonable alternatives
 - o Provides complete and transparent financial information
 - o Properly considers community, educational, and wellbeing impacts

49	I write to express my vigorous and passionate objection to the proposed closure of Manorbier School. Since the devastating fire over three and a half years ago the children, staff and wider school community has been failed at every juncture by Pembrokeshire County Council. The total lack of communication, clarity and any kind of plan has been nothing short of a disgrace. The staff, parents, governors and most importantly the children have shown resilience, determination and courage to soldier on in these devastating circumstances...for three and a half years! For the staff continue to provide an exceptional level of education and care in this unprecedented situation is nothing short of superhuman in effort. False promises and an abject failure to communicate clearly with all stakeholders by PCC has left a genuine and raw feeling of betrayal. The children of Manorbier school have been failed by The Director of Education and Pembrokeshire County Council. Neither has been held accountable. No liability for the fire has been established or even attempted to be established. Nobody has been held accountable. Why? This question will not go away and must be answered. Then in addition to this catalogue of failures PCC nominate Manorbier School for closure. This is not only cruel, it is unethical and immoral. A sham of a consultation was held..the huge petition response in favour of keeping the school open was ignored completely. The huge, passionate and detailed written responses to the consultation were completely ignored and not given adequate weight by PCC. The consultation is a one way street to closure. The process is a joke where The Director of Education acts as Judge, jury and executioner. How is this possible? How is this ethical? How is this legitimate? The number of inaccuracies in the consultation document were highlighted by me and a Councillor Kidney in a meeting at County Hall in November 2025 with Mr Will Bramble. The way in which the consultation was spun and weighted in favour of closure was also highlighted in the same meeting. Nothing was done and no accountability was ever established. Then the order in which the debate and vote on Manorbier school was due to be cast at full council was altered at the last minute with no explanation. No accountability or reasoning was ever established for this sudden change in the order of the debate and vote. Following the vote in favour of closing the school, I as Chair of Governors have not received any correspondence at all from the Director of Education. As a volunteer who has given blood, sweat and tears and a huge amount of time and effort to keeping this school open, I find this lack of manners and basic human decency deeply offensive and troubling. How can The Director of Education who is responsible for our children's education lack even basic manners? What example does this set to our children and our communities? How can Manorbier School be closed based on its surplus places when our school is a derelict, burnt out building that we have no access to? How? In the current setting we are in at Jameston Village Hall we are running close to capacity for that building. How can our staffing costs be highlighted and criticised when our retention of staff was in preparation and readiness to return to the school
----	---

site as promised by Councillors and PCC? How?

There are a number of fundamental questions that need to be answered. These questions will not go away.
The way in which this process has been conducted by The Director of Education will not be forgotten and he will be held to account

This planned closure is unsafe and unjust and should be halted immediately to allow for a full enquiry to find answers to the questions posed above.

As a governor who has served this unique and incredibly special school for nearly 14 years I am heartbroken and dismayed at how we have been treated. It is a total and utter disgrace.

I hope the Director has the professionalism, self motivation and personal integrity to meet with me to discuss this matter in full.

I request acknowledgment of receipt of this objection as I have no trust or confidence in PCC.

50	I have been deeply shocked and disappointed by the decision of the education director and other councillors to close Manorbier School. Im not naive and realise that sometimes difficult decisions need to be made. But I always believed that the process was there to ensure that mistakes weren't made and the wrong schools close, how wrong I was. These are the points I would like to make. 1. We were promised by PCC that the school would be rebuilt. Which was A LIE! 2. Why has there been no accountability for the Fire? Children could have died from the total negligence of the roofing company. The fire report confirms that the fire was started on the roof by the hot roof equipment. 4. Why did PCC not persue the roofing company for damages/insurance? Did PCC do all of its due diligence with risk assessments etc...? Was everything correctly in place? I can only assume that it wasn't, otherwise why not persue the roofing company when it such a clear case of their negligence/ 5. Why were incorrect figures used in the consultation document. I wrote twice to PCC to inform you that the figures were incorrect. And basically you couldn't care less. Which shows me that this was all a forgone conclusion. 6. The farce of the consulation, the lack of accurate information, the bias towards closing, the lack of integrity and honesty from PCC has stunned me. 7. You don't even have a plan for the closure as you have no idea how much it is going to cost yourselves to close the school and do what needs to be done to the site to hand it back to the diocese. The lack of care and protection of public money is disgraceful. To let a company of scot free for endangering the lives of 30 children, supposedly under you care, is frankly disgusting. If that company goes on to have another accident (as they clearly are totally incompetent) people might not be so lucky as the children of Manorbier. I truly hope you are not still using that company. In conclusion you should all be ashamed of yourselves. You will be remembered as the council that closed a thriving, successful, high achieving school, and for what purpose?
51	I object to the closure of Manorbier school. Surely Pcc have a legal obligation to repair/replace the building which was damaged due to negligence, surely the contractors who caused the fire should be held personally responsible?? This school community is so much more than a building, there are pupils there who have aln and they really need this small school. After all youre not providing more sen places atm. Stand up to your responsibilities and do the right thing.

We cannot stress enough how strongly we object to the closure of Manorbier VC School.

The impact on our son and his school friends will be unmeasurable, the false promise of a rebuild, the downright lies that have been told about a rebuild.

Three years our lives have been on hold for Pembrokeshire County Council and you personally to do do the right thing in reinstating our wonderful school.

Three years of our son being held in a temporary site when he should have been in his wonderful school building.

Three years of lack of information and lack of accountability.

Three years, four on the 10th of October this year.

The 10th of October, a date etched into so many of our hearts. The day in which we as parents thought our children had been hurt or even killed in a fire that was no fault of the School, the staff or the Children.

We as parents are still waiting for the information regarding what has actually happened to the insurance money?! two if not three people we know have asked under the freedom of information act for that exact answer.

We believe the school has been deliberately left to a state of disrepair on purpose. When will any of the councilors involved be honest about that?

The Diocese strongly objects to closure. The people of our parish strongly object to closure, the Governors of Manorbier School strongly object to closure, the staff strongly object to closure, the parents of children that attend Manorbier school strongly object to closure. How many objections does the Council have to receive to even consider its complete failings? We have no confidence in the honesty or accuracy of information from Pembrokeshire County Council regarding the closure of Manorbier School, and we believe this to be true for most of the public in our parish and wider still.

Five months after a meeting in December when my husband Richard Hughes represented our wonderful School at the council meeting stating all of the above, he highlighted the data and number misinformation and more and yet no one is accountable for answering his questions, the questions of the public, the questions of the school, all of which were meant to be relayed back to him in March this year. This was stated in the public domain of that meeting back in December, how completely unprofessional and dishonest of all that were witness to the above.

The failings in education overall in Pembrokeshire seems to be falling apart at the seams.

In the early stages of a possible closure we were told our children could go to Tenby primary School, a school around ten years old, with a roof so badly damaged its now not even being suggested as a substitute, the the consultation suggests St Florence School.

An old building, lack of toilets, roads to access it that are downright dangerous and unfit for use, no safe parking for drop off or pick ups, honestly far from perfect and yet the whole consultation was about St Florence.

Our child has been through enough upset and uncertainty regarding the future of his School, he will be moving into year six in September, an important year for him with transition to secondary the year after. We chose Manorbier School because its in our village, its a wonderful school, highly trained teachers, a church School with Christianity at its heart. All the things we wanted for our son.

During the last years we have been working very closely with our school to ensure our son gets all the support he needs, he does!! Our son has autism and finds lots of things challenging, change being one of hardest to understand and navigate. Change which we try so hard not to cause and yet he and so many other children are going to be forced into a situation far from perfect or right. If asked our son would state he has no voice in which to make Pembrokeshire County Council hear and yet he is heard and listened to with the teachers he has.

The impact of closing our small rural school will cause the death of a village, Manorbier school is at the heart of our community, are you prepared to rip it out and kill the rural area?

53	I am writing to object to the proposed closure of Manorbier School. Rural schools are at the heart of the community and the closure of the school would have a long term effect on the identity of the area and sends a clear message that rural Pembrokeshire doesn't deserve the same consideration as large towns. The inequality is further compounded by stretching the pupils' school days by forcing them on longer journeys to and from school, and consequently preventing them from accessing after school activities, because they wouldn't have transport home. The economic argument that smaller, rural schools cost more to run equates to nothing beside a dead village, and no economic growth in the community. I urge you to reconsider,
54	Response 1: I am writing to express my strong support for keeping Manorbier school open. For our family, the school is a rare resource within Pembrokeshire. The teachers are trained in trauma-informed practices and they are exceptionally supportive of children who experience social anxiety and emotional challenges. This level of care and understanding is something we've not found in larger schools. Having previously experienced bullying, my son's confidence and wellbeing depend greatly on being in an environment where he feels secure, understood, and supported. Schools like this are essential for vulnerable children and for the wider community. Closing it would mean the loss of a precious resource for families who rely on this kind of compassionate and specialised support. Thank you for taking the time to consider the impact this decision will have on children and families like ours. Response 2: What's more we are not aware of any other schools in the area whose staff have the same trauma-informed approach and understanding of vulnerable children.

55	The St Davids Diocesan Board of Finance (DBF) formally objects to the Notice of the Pembrokeshire County Council's (PCC's) proposal to discontinue Manorbier VC School, Manorbier, Tenby SA70 7SN. The reasons for this objection are as follows: 1. The DBF wishes to retain a Faith School in Manorbier. 2. The fact that the building was seriously underinsured is obviously a cause for embarrassment, which is deserving of public outcry. The impact of this on the public purse will be great. It is felt that Councillors voted on the proposal at the meeting of the Full Council on 5 March 2026, without being in receipt of all of the facts. It seems incredible that Councillors could make a decision of this magnitude without having an open discussion about the cost of handing the building back to the DBF. There has been no open discussion regarding the liability arising from the fire—caused by a PCC contractor—or the significant under-insurance of the asset. The DBF will not accept the return of the building in its current dilapidated state. 3. Lack of transparency. The DBF has still not had access to Appendix H of the original document (the DBF does not accept that this should be withheld – a redacted version to protect commercial sensitivities, but showing figures, could be shared with our Trustees) even with, if appropriate, an NDA. This document was referred to in the debate. Your Director of Education offered to resend it to councillors, who appeared not to have received it in advance of the discussion. The DBF was thus put at a significant disadvantage and was unable to offer a considered response as it was not in possession of all the facts, as a major stakeholder and owner of the building. Again, the DBF requests sight of this (redacted) document. 4. The strength of feeling in the local community and further afield was quite evident by the number of objections received by PCC in response to the consultation. Your Director of Education published the following information in his own Consultation Report (5 March 2026): 90.48% (228 responses) do not support the proposal. 7.94% (20 responses) support the proposal. There appears to be a complete disregard for public opinion here, and the integrity of some Council Officers and Councillors alike must be brought into question. To proceed in the face of such overwhelming community opposition—without resolving the underlying issues of contractor negligence and insurance failure—constitutes a failure of the Council's mandate to act in the public interest. Further, local authorities do not possess absolute power; they hold their powers in trust for the benefit of the local community. When 90% of the community expresses a clear preference, the PCC must provide rationality for overriding that view. If the PCC primary motivation for closure is to avoid the financial fallout of their own insurance negligence, they are placing their administrative convenience above their fiduciary duty to the public. Furthermore, the community has a legitimate expectation that a consultation is a meaningful dialogue. When the PCC ignores a 90% opposition rate, it transforms the consultation into a mere notification and in doing so, we argue the PCC is acting ultra vires by failing to give due weight and consideration to the very people it is legally empowered to represent. 5. The DBF was somewhat shocked that the PCC's Chief Executive stated that the DBF would “be reasonable” in relation to negotiations
----	---

	concerning the return of the building. The DBF has been nothing but reasonable in its approach to a situation which was not of its doing. There are great concerns for the safety of the site and its continuing deterioration, given that nothing meaningful has been done to protect the existing structures. The continued exposure to the elements is very likely to be having a further detrimental effect on the fire damaged buildings. The DBF will not accept the return of the building in its current condition. This has been made perfectly clear in previous correspondence and continues to be the position of the DBF Trustees. Indeed the PCC has failed to take meaningful steps to protect the fire-damaged structures from further degradation. The DBF holds PCC liable for the continuing deterioration of both the school and the schoolhouse. The continued delay is a breach of the Council's duty of candor. 6. There is a continued absence of any formal information in writing relating to any proposed or anticipated reinstatement costs, despite this being promised once more, by your Director of Education, at a meeting with representatives of the DBF, including the Bishop, on the 1 April. We, again, make a request for this information. 7. The DBF has evidence of pre-determination regarding this closure. The PCC Human Resources Department initiated voluntary redundancy consultations with staff in February 2026—prior to the Full Council vote on 5 March 2026. This suggests the statutory consultation was a perfunctory exercise rather than a genuine consideration of options, rendering the process legally flawed. Can you explain this? 8. There is also the additional matter concerning Manorbier Schoolhouse, which was also destroyed by the fire. The DBF is in a position where it is currently unable to reinstate the building due to the uncertainty relating to the future of the school. The DBF is currently prevented from reinstating this domestic dwelling due to the uncertainty caused by PCC's handling of the school site. We reserve the right to recover all ongoing costs and losses from PCC and its contractors As has been said from the outset, the DBF remains committed to maintaining a Faith School in Manorbier. We urge the Council to halt the discontinuation process and engage in transparent negotiations regarding the reinstatement of the buildings
--	--

56	I write in my capacity as Director of Education for the Church in Wales, in support of the Diocesan Board of Finance (DBF), to submit a formal statutory objection to Pembrokeshire County Council’s proposal to discontinue Manorbier Church in Wales Voluntary Controlled School. This objection is made pursuant to the School Standards and Organisation (Wales) Act 2013 and the School Organisation Code (2018). Having reviewed the consultation documentation, the Consultation Report presented to Full Council on 5 March 2026, and subsequent correspondence and statements, I agree with the DBF’s conclusion that the proposal is procedurally flawed, evidentially deficient, and fails to meet the statutory requirements of openness, transparency, fairness, and meaningful engagement with key stakeholders. My objections are set out under the following headings: 1. Retention of a Faith School in Manorbier The DBF makes clear at the outset that it wishes to retain a Church in Wales faith school in Manorbier. Manorbier Church in Wales VC School has long served its community through a distinctive Christian ethos combined with inclusive, high-quality education. The DBF has consistently maintained that reinstatement following the fire represents the appropriate and lawful starting point for consideration, rather than permanent discontinuation. The proposal to close the school fails to demonstrate that all reasonable alternatives, including reinstatement and phased return to permanent accommodation, have been properly explored, as required by the School Organisation Code. 2. Underinsurance of the Building and Incomplete Information to Councillors The DBF recognises that the serious underinsurance of the school building is a matter of considerable public concern and disappointment, particularly given the potential impact on the public purse. However, it is deeply troubling that Councillors appear to have been asked to vote on a proposal of this magnitude on 5 March 2026 without being in possession of all relevant material facts, including the full financial implications of handing the fire-damaged building back to the DBF. It is difficult to reconcile how a fully informed decision could be taken without open discussion of reinstatement liabilities, ownership responsibilities, and associated costs, particularly where these costs appear to have materially influenced the recommendation. 3. Lack of Transparency – Withholding of Appendix H The DBF continues to be denied access to Appendix H of the original report, despite repeated requests. I do not accept that this entire document should be withheld from the DBF as building owner and statutory stakeholder. A redacted version, protecting genuinely sensitive commercial information while disclosing headline figures and assumptions, could and should have been shared with Trustees. Appendix H was explicitly referred to during the Council debate, and the Director of Education stated that he would resend it to Councillors, many of whom appeared not to have received it in advance. The DBF was therefore placed at a significant disadvantage and unable to offer a meaningful or informed response, contrary to both the letter and spirit of the School Organisation Code. I support the DBF’s formal request to have sight of Appendix H in redacted form. 4. Disregard for Public Opinion The strength of local and wider community feeling is incontrovertible. Your own Consultation Report, published on 5 March 2026, states clearly that: • 90.48% (228 responses) did not support the proposal, and only • 7.94% (20 responses) supported the proposal. I am deeply concerned that this overwhelming opposition appears to have been given little or no weight in the decision-making process. The apparent dismissal of such a clear consultation outcome raises serious questions about the integrity of the process and whether consultation was approached as a genuine exercise, rather than a procedural formality. 5. Return of the Building and Ongoing Deterioration The DBF was alarmed by the statement made by the Council’s Chief Executive that the DBF would “be reasonable” in any negotiations concerning the return of the building. The DBF has been entirely reasonable throughout, in circumstances not of its making. The DBF’s position has been consistently and clearly stated: the DBF will not accept return of the building in its current condition. I am gravely concerned about: • site safety, • the absence of meaningful protective works, and • the ongoing deterioration of the fire-damaged structures due to continued exposure to the elements. Any suggestion that the DBF should now assume responsibility for an unsafe and worsening asset is wholly unacceptable. 6. Absence of Reinstatement Cost Information Despite repeated assurances, including those given by the Director of Education at a meeting with DBF representatives, including the Bishop, on 1 April 2026, the DBF has still not received any written information regarding proposed or anticipated reinstatement costs. This information is fundamental to informed consideration of future options. Its continued absence reinforces the DBF’s concern that decisions are being taken without an adequate evidential base. I support
----	--

	the formal request that this information be provided without further delay. 7. Premature HR Action and Apparent Predetermination I was appalled to learn that the Council's HR department contacted school staff regarding voluntary redundancies at the end of February 2026, prior to the Full Council decision. This action strongly suggests predetermination of outcome, despite repeated assurances by the Local Authority that no such pre-determination existed. This is a serious matter, and I support the DBF's request for a clear explanation as to how such contact was compatible with a live statutory process. 8. Manorbier Schoolhouse Finally, the DBF draws attention to the additional matter of Manorbier Schoolhouse, which was also destroyed in the fire. The DBF is currently unable to reinstate this property due to ongoing uncertainty regarding the future of the school. As a result, the DBF is incurring continuing costs. The DBF is actively seeking legal advice regarding recovery of these costs from Pembrokeshire County Council and its contractor. Conclusion For the reasons set out above, I consider that the proposal to discontinue Manorbier Church in Wales VC School: • lacks transparency, • relies on incomplete and withheld information, • disregards overwhelming public opposition, • places unfair and unacceptable risk on the DBF, • and fails to comply with the statutory requirements of the School Organisation Code. Accordingly, I, as the Director of Education for The Church in Wales, formally objects to the proposal and requests that the Council withdraws it, re-engages constructively with the DBF, and works collaboratively towards a reinstatement-based solution in the best interests of children, families, and the community of Manorbier.
--	---

Formal objection to PCC's decision to close Manorbier Church in Wales VC Primary School.

1. Pembrokeshire Council's justification for the closure is based on inaccurate / incomplete and therefore misleading information. This is wrong. No opportunity was given for the school staff to verify/confirm the accuracy of the information used by the Council in their proposal, prior to publication.
 2. A member of the Pembrokeshire school organisation team asked the school whether the school had been given an opportunity by PCC to verify information, to which the school answered it had not.
 3. The MP Henry Tufnell in February 26, having been consulted by members of the school community, expressed to the constituents his view based on his communication with several PCC officers that there was nothing he could do to help the community or change the decision as he had been assured by PCC Officers that the decision had already been made. This is a mockery of local democracy at all levels.
 4. NASUWT Cymru stands firmly by every word of the joint TU consultation response and submit this formal objection, deeply disappointed and concerned that a grave injustice is happening here.
 5. Once Councillors had actually visited the school and were in possession of the full picture and key facts, there was a noticeable increase in the number of councillors voting in favour of the school's continuation. Sadly, it appears that they knew too little for most of the duration of the consultation process. The school community welcomed their visit and would have welcomed others had they been interested in finding out about the school. Were Councillors discouraged from making direct visits?
 6. Lack of transparency: majority of F.O.I. requests throughout the process have been refused, begging the question, what is PCC hiding - and why?
 7. The school's insurance status: no accountability and complete lack of transparency.
 8. The leader of the School Reorganisation Committee offended the school community by requesting of the councillors that they took the emotion out of the decision, as if cancelling out the community's lived experience yet in PCC's mission statement wellbeing and mental health are meant to be paramount. PCC should not disregard PCC's own policies and declared values. The statement made on behalf of the committee shook the whole school community as it clearly made light of the trauma experienced by all: the trauma of the fire itself followed by 3 years of waiting for the rebuild promised by PCC and the further trauma of being betrayed by those in authority.
 9. Process has been handled very poorly on many levels – from the fact that the contractual notice periods may seemingly not be being respected as teaching staff should be paid until December according to the Burgundy Book if the decision to close goes ahead and information about each stage not having been forthcoming and therefore upsetting surprises arising, sometimes with the community gleaning more from the Media than the council.
 10. No evidence of meaningful consideration of Councillor Woodham's suggestion to change the proposal significantly and to reconsult.
- On the basis of the above objections, we urge PCC to abandon this flawed process and proposal that has already damaged the community and destroyed trust in local democracy, in a number of senior PCC officers / elected representatives.
- This proposal is not in the interests of the children and families the Council serves, our members, wider staff and the people of this community, Diocese included, whose voices have not been heard, and there remains too much key information hidden for this process to reach a fair, fact-based conclusion.

58	I am writing to formally object to the proposal to discontinue Manorbier VC School. I believe this proposal has been progressed on the basis of flawed, misleading, and unreliable information, alongside a failure to properly acknowledge and give due weight to objections raised during the consultation process. In particular, the repeated reference to “significant surplus places” is fundamentally misleading. The capacity figures relied upon are based on the school building prior to the fire damage, despite the fact that the building is no longer available in that form. It is therefore impossible for the school to operate at the historic capacity figures being used by the Council. Using these outdated figures creates a distorted impression of under-occupation and unfairly supports a predetermined narrative for closure. A decision of this magnitude must be based on accurate, current, and transparent evidence. In this case, it clearly is not. I am also deeply concerned that statutory consultees who raised significant objections appear to have been disregarded. In particular, the Diocese of St Davids strongly objected to the proposal, yet these objections do not appear to have been meaningfully reflected in the Council's conclusions or recommendations. The views of statutory consultees are not optional considerations. They form a critical part of a lawful and balanced consultation process. Where strong objections from key consultees are effectively ignored, serious concerns arise regarding whether the consultation has been conducted fairly and in accordance with the principles of proper public decision-making. There is a growing perception within the community that the outcome of this process was predetermined and that contradictory evidence and objections have been minimised or dismissed in order to justify closure. The Council has a legal duty to act fairly, rationally, and transparently. Decisions based on materially inaccurate information, or reached through a process that fails to properly consider consultation responses and statutory objections, may be vulnerable to legal challenge, including Judicial Review. The future of a village school, its pupils, and its wider community should not be decided on the basis of flawed statistics and a consultation process that many believe has failed to genuinely engage with legitimate concerns. For these reasons, I urge the Council to withdraw or reconsider this proposal and undertake a fair, transparent, and evidence-based reassessment before any final decision is made. Please accept this email as my formal objection to the proposal.
----	---

59	I would like to register my objection to the decision to close Manorbier School. There are many reasons, including I believe the lawfulness in the matter however I would also like to add my thoughts on the closure. Manorbier would benefit from a school in the village. There is the opportunity I believe to build on a what is already a wonderful school to create a place used by existing pupils and encourage more families to live in the area. Without a local school and families the village will slip further into an area of holiday homes and it will lose its heart. Having lived in the village for nearly 30 years, my grandson joined the school just over a year ago when we believed that the school would be rebuilt. Despite the school being in temporary accommodation he has, more importantly, been given the best nurturing care possible. He has developed greatly, both educationally and socially. The small nurturing environment with its excellent head teacher and staff has been the key factor in his growth. The children, parents and staff support each other and it would be a huge loss to everyone if the school closes. Another point of objection is travelling to the proposed school at St Florence from Manorbier. The road down to the village is a road most local people will avoid if they can and is not suitable for the ever increasing size of vehicles. I used to have to go that way and know that it can regularly be a terrible bottleneck if you get more than a couple of cars trying to manoeuvre past each other at once. Even before travelling down that road we would have to drive through the regularly deeply flooded roads out of Manorbier to get to the Ridgeway. We are always being encouraged to walk to schools if we can which is a key benefit of a local school The process of decision making around the school has been long and quite distressing. It has been quite unfair and difficult for the excellent staff who have been so very positive with the children. I hope that people's objections will be heard and carefully considered and that reasons such as value for money aren't always the best reasons.
60	No Comment
61	To whom it may concern, I strongly and deeply object, based on my experience as a parent of a current pupil, plus a future pupil (aged1), and as a lifelong resident of Manorbier. Our village children deserve a local school, not a substitute one miles in the opposite direction of our workplaces. Our village deserves to feel like the council recognises its value as a special rural community - not its value as a holiday themepark. Removing the school accelerates its decline into holiday houses and soullessness. Utterly dismayed by the council's priorities here. Protect your communities and the local children.

62	As Chair of Manorbier Community Council and Jameston Community Association I write to you formally to object in the strongest possible manner regarding the closure of Manorbier Church in Wales School. Steven Richard Downes Director of Education was invited to attend a meeting of Manorbier Community Council in which he publicly assured us that the school would be rebuilt and reopened. WHAT'S HAPPENED ? The overall feeling in our parish is the school should be reinstated. As Chair of the Jameston Community Association I feel let down by the lack of correspondence from yourselves and any clarity as to the position of the school. The Jameston Community Association has been good enough to allow the unprecedented use of the hall on the proviso working with and for the Community. WHAT IS THE COMMUNITY WITHOUT A SCHOOL? The Association is more than happy to allow the school to continue use of the hall until the school is rebuilt. This was discussed at the recent Jameston Community association AGM which was supported by over one hundred people. Everybody voted in favour of the school remaining in the hall until the school is rebuilt I feel the community, pupils and staff have been severely let down by the total lack of communication and transparency.MY WIFE AND I STRONGLY OBJECT TO THE CLOSURE OF MANORBIER CHURCH IN WALES SCHOOL.
----	---